HR Processes
Search Committee
Hiring Process

"People are not your most important asset. The right people are."

– Jim Collins, *Good to Great*

*Owens Community College*
HR Processes
Team Members

Champion
Dr. William Ivoska, Vice President Student Services

Team Leader
Donna Gruber, Director Enrollment Services

Scribe
Sara Wilgus, Account Clerk Child Care

Team Member
Tekla Madaras, Chair Dietetics and HRI

Team Member
Darla Johannsen, Faculty IT
Table of Contents

Background .................................................. Page4
Project Statement ........................................... Page6
Definitions .................................................... Page7
Current Processes ......................................... Page8
Causes of Current Situation/Current Outcomes ...... Page17
Cost Of A Bad Hire ......................................... Page18
Improvement Theory ....................................... Page20
Assessment .................................................. Page23
Project Timeline ............................................ Page24
Future Team Projects ....................................... Page25
Attachments ................................................ Page26
Background

The Human Resource Processes Team reviewed six different issues presented by the process mapping steering committee. They were: Better Full-Time Faculty Ratio, The Employee Evaluation Process, The Hiring Process, The Student Worker Process, Increasing Faculty Members, and lastly Increasing Staff Members.

Three of the issues, which were reviewed, are dependant upon increases to the College budget (Better Full-Time Faculty Ratio, Increasing Faculty Members and Increasing Staff Members), which the Human Resource Processes team felt they could not impact due to the current state budget status. Another team within the College is currently undertaking revamping of the student worker process, and the Employee Evaluation Process was thought to be stable at the present time.

That left The Hiring Process. The hiring process is a large procedure that begins with the identification of the need for a position to be filled by the College and ends with the new employee orientation. Human Resources has gone through tremendous change within the last year, implementing a new automated hiring system which is currently being put into operation across campus and initiating new procedures for current and potential employees regarding the hiring process. The Human Resource Processes team felt that a piece within the hiring process that has not been addressed is the Search Committee Process.

The search committee process is a vital piece of the hiring process, which is often overlooked or minimized. A good search committee can improve the hiring process and result in a committed College employee.

The Human Resource Processes team felt that whichever project was selected must support the College's overall mission and strategic plan. The team felt confident
that the Search Committee Process was in direct line with the Strategic Plan strategy of Organizational Vitality -

"We will continuously monitor, evaluate and align available resources to ensure that the College has highly trained, competitively compensated and diverse workforce that has adequate support and logical processes and procedures to accomplish their mission"

Each and every hiring decision the College makes has long-term consequences. A good hire is one that is best qualified and best matched to the job requirements and environment. Hiring the best candidate takes planning and an effective hiring and selection process. Without this selection process the College will not be able to achieve a strong, efficient, diverse workforce.
Project Statement

To improve the search committee portion of the hiring process as measured by consistent composition and training
Definitions

**Budget Authority** – Person responsible for maintaining the department budget. This person must provide approval for job requisition to be processed to ensure necessary funds are available to support a new hire.

**Hiring Authority** – Person responsible for making the final hiring decision. This person is often the chair of the Search committee.

**Human Resources** – Department which manages the hiring, and maintaining of employees within the institution. They develop and manage the payroll, benefits, retirement, and company polices. They also organize company wide events and activities and administer the development of training programs and seminars to improve employee’s skills.

**Interview** - A formal meeting in person, arranged for the assessment of the qualifications of an applicant.

**Search Packet** - An internal document used to initiate the hiring process. It is typically prepared by the hiring authority.

**Search Committee** – A group of employees responsible for reviewing resumes, selecting candidates for interview, interviewing candidates and recommending a candidate for hire for a specific position.

**Search Committee Chair** – Person responsible for overseeing the activity of the search committee.

“Don’t hire just because you have an open position. Wait for the ‘great hire’”

-Mike Murray, Brigham Young University
Current Processes
Analysis of Situation

The current hiring process was examined by the team in conjunction with Human Resources and is demonstrated in the following flow chart.

Owens Community College Workflow
9/26/2005

The following user types are currently in the system:

1. HumanResources
2. Preparer
3. HiringManager
4. Dean/Director
5. Budget
6. President/Council
7. President
8. SearchChair

* the ability to change a requisition's status (box above) will be based upon a user's user type
The Search committee process was examined as well by the team and with the input of the Vice President of Human Resources the following Search committee flowchart was formed.

**Search Committee Process**

Hiring Authority selects a Search committee Chair (could be hiring authority)

Committee Chair sends Search committee names to Human Resources

Human Resources contacts Committee Chair with names of search committee members who have not been trained

Search committee Chair either chooses new committee members or instructs members who are NOT trained to schedule training with Human Resources

Search committee members who have NOT been trained complete training with Human Resources

Search committee Members review resumes

Search committee Members meet to discuss resumes and select candidates for interviews

Search committee Members interview selected candidates

Search committee Members make hiring recommendation
After examining the search committee process through interviews and a survey (see attachment 1) the Human Resource Processes Team discovered that Human Resources does not have an efficient monitoring system of the search committee training. Several weak links were found in the current search committee process specifically focused on training of the committee. These weak links are identified in red on the flow chart (see page 9). One weak link is that Search committee Chairs are not always aware that all members of their search committee must have gone through training. Therefore, some committee chairs have not informed their members of this training, and it in turn has not been completed. The counterpart to this weak link is that Human Resources has not been consistent in notifying Search committee Chairs of search committee members who have not been trained therefore there is the potential that committee members may never attend training yet still remain on the hiring committee. Another weak link is that search committee members don’t always comply with the search committee chair’s request to complete the hiring process training through Human Resources, and because Human Resources does not have a consistent training tracking process these members are not forced to complete this training. Thus, once again, committee members may end up participating on a search committee without the appropriate training. The survey that was administered by the Human Resource Processes Team supported this weakness with results that showed that out of the 50 random Owens Community College employees surveyed 39 had been part of a search committee and out of those 39 only 27 had gone through search committee training (see page 12). Human Resources also does not have a consistent, standard search committee-training program. Search committee training is completed on an as needed basis and varies in length and content. The survey supported this inconsistency
with results showing that there is a wide variety in the length of training time for those who completed the search committee training (see page 13). There is also no refresher course available to employees of the College who have not been part of a search committee within the last year which is an employee need demonstrated by the survey with the majority of employees surveyed requesting re-training or a refresher course (see page 14). Lastly, the Employment Guide presented to employees during search committee training has not been updated since 2002 (see attachment 2) and it has not been consistently provided to employees during training. The survey demonstrated that overall there is not a consistent distribution of training materials to employees during the training process (see page 15).

Overall the survey administered by the Human Resource Processes team showed that of those who had attended search committee training the majority felt the training was one of quality, giving it a ranking of good to excellent (see page 16). This result demonstrates the commitment current Human Resource employees at Owens Community College have towards presenting high quality, thorough information. It also shows that the employees of Owens Community College feel the training provided is of value.
Owens Community College Hiring/Selection Committee Employee Needs

Employee Training Needs

- Re-Training
- Best Candidate Selection
- Committee Leadership
- OCC Hiring Practices

Number
Owens Community College Materials Provided During Hiring/Selection Committee Training

- None
- OCC Policies
- Information on Legal Issues
- Sample Questions
- Handbook

Number

- 18
- 16
- 14
- 12
- 10
- 8
- 6
- 4
- 2
- 0
Causes of Current Situation

Many factors contribute to the weak links within the Search committee Process; these include lack of staff to facilitate appropriate training, lack of employee training standardization, lack of training tracking, and lack of system capabilities for search committee tracking and training.
Cost of a Bad Hire

The current situation regarding the search committee process does not lend itself to find, select and hire the best employees for Owens Community College. With United States workforce losing approximately 100 million dollars each month as a result of bad hires, the impact is tremendous. Hiring the wrong people drastically affects customer satisfaction and overall profitability. A bad hire can reduce productivity, hurt customer support and delay project progress. The cost that a bad hire has on business is difficult to measure but taken into consideration are the hours and dollars spent recruiting and interviewing the employee, the production time lost during training of the new employee along with the dollars and hours spent training them. Some reports show that organizations lose approximately $60,000 per bad hire and the loss increases as the complexity and salary increase within a position. Also it must be taken into account that bad hires typically are high maintenance employees that require more management time and effort than a great hire. Bad hires are also less productive over all and make more errors. These errors must be corrected which again requires time and dollars from either a manager or another employee. If the error isn’t corrected the customer will choose another service, in this case a student will decide to go to another college because she cannot get what she needs and desires from Owens Community College. Another difficult to measure loss from a bad hire is the impact it has on current good employees. Bad hires can drive those hard working, great employees away due to the increased workload from the bad hire as well as the message it sets forth to the good employee. “Superstars often resent being on the same team as losers” – Dr. John Sullivan, San Francisco State University
The time and money that is lost on a bad hire as well as the damage caused in efficiency and productivity within the College makes the search committee process even more important. It is that much more important to invest time, money and effort into a well developed and implemented search committee training process.

"Hiring managers have a responsibility to hire the candidate who will best meet the current and future needs of both the department and the College. Every open position is an opportunity for change, new vision, and improvement”

-President Cecil O. Samuelson, BYU
Improvement Theory and Implementation Plan

Fortunately, the improvements needed for the search committee process are relatively easy to implement.

- **Search Committee Checklist** – this checklist should be a reference tool for the search committee overall but specifically for the chair of the committee. The committee chair is responsible for the overall process of his or her committee and should be able to track the process through a systematic checklist.

- **Search Committee Chair Training** – the committee chair often has the unique task of creating the hiring committee. The composition of the committee can have a very large impact on the selection of new employees. If there is no diversity on the search committee it is unlikely there will be diversity in the hiring process. The best candidate for the position may not be selected because the search committee may not understand the job duties fully. The search committee chair must also support and maintain the search committee during candidate interviewing and selection. These are tasks that require supplemental training in addition to the general search committee training.

- **Search Committee Training** – the search committee is responsible for eliminating interviewer bias, fairly reviewing resumes, and providing honest, thoughtful feedback on each candidate all while maintaining legal requirements. The committee should be trained in how to accurately review a resume and application, selecting candidates for an interview, interviewing techniques, creating interview questions, guidelines for legal interviews, selecting a candidate, making offers, and completing necessary hiring paperwork.
• Documentation of Training – because the training for search committees is so important it is necessary for all committee members to be trained fully prior to the hiring process portion of reviewing resumes. Therefore, all employees chosen for a search committee must have documented proof that they have completed this training. Human Resources must maintain this documentation and communicate with the committee chair of those on the committee who have not completed training. This documentation can be as simple as an Excel spreadsheet or as sophisticated as becoming a piece of the automated hiring system being utilized in Human Resources. The committee chair must communicate to the employees that they will not be able to be a part of the search committee without the training and assist the employee in scheduling the training prior to resume review.

• Provide Refresher Training – laws, policies and procedures change rapidly therefore employees must complete a refresher training every two years.

• Update Employment Guide – the employment guide that was last updated in 2002 is a valuable tool for search committee members to use as a reference guide during the search committee process. The guide can be paper or electronic.

Cooperation between Human Resources and the Human Resource Processes team will be necessary to complete all the recommended improvements. The end result will be a well-trained workforce, which is capable of making strong hiring decisions, which ultimately support the College’s strategy of organizational vitality.
Search Committee Process Improvement

- Train Selection Committee Chair
  - Develop Training Program
  - Establish Training Process
  - Provide Training
  - Track Training

- Train Selection Committee Members
  - Develop Training Program
  - Establish Training Process
  - Provide Training
  - Track Training

- Training Tool Kit
  - Define Information Presented
  - Develop Tracking System

- Assessment
  - Administer Follow-up Survey

Selection Committee Process Improvement
Assessment

It is the Human Resource Processes Team’s belief that by implementing and continuously evaluating this process the College will be assured that every employee selected for a search committee will be trained and prepared to be a valuable part of the hiring process.

The Human Resource Processes Team recommends task monitoring according to the Search Committee Process Improvement Timeline created. These task quality checks would be conducted by the future Human Resource Processes Team, which will also be responsible for the search committee training creation and implementation. Each quality check will take place one week after projected completion according to the Search Committee Process Improvement Timeline.

The Human Resource Processes Team also recommends follow-up surveys be randomly administered to search committee chairs and members. This survey would be administered during the summer of 2006. Results of this survey will be analyzed collaboratively with a future Human Resource Processes Team and Human Resources. The survey tool may be the original survey administered by the Human Resource Processes Team or modified to include specific training enhancements.

Once the improvements are in place continuous monitoring of this search committee training process will be required. Human Resources will be responsible for maintaining an accurate database of who has been trained and what materials have been provided.

This continuous assessment will ensure a standardized; quality search committee is in place for each and every hire within the College.
## Search Committee Process Improvement Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Improvement Theories</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Start</th>
<th>Finish</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Q4/Q5</th>
<th>Q6/Q7</th>
<th>Q8/Q9</th>
<th>Q9/Q10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Identify all Hiring Authorities on Campus</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>2/1/2006</td>
<td>3/1/2006</td>
<td>4.14w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Train all Hiring Authorities on Automated</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>3/1/2006</td>
<td>4/1/2006</td>
<td>4.57w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hiring System</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Create Tracking System for Training</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>2/1/2006</td>
<td>2/28/2006</td>
<td>4w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Create Selection Committee Chair Training</td>
<td>Process Mapping Team &amp; HR</td>
<td>3/1/2006</td>
<td>5/1/2006</td>
<td>8.88w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Create Selection Committee Training</td>
<td>Process Mapping Team &amp; HR</td>
<td>3/1/2006</td>
<td>5/1/2006</td>
<td>8.88w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Begin Training of Selection Committee Members</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>6/1/2006</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Create Refresher Training</td>
<td>Process Mapping Team &amp; HR</td>
<td>7/1/2006</td>
<td>8/1/2006</td>
<td>4.57w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Implement Selection Committee Training into</td>
<td>Process Mapping Team &amp; HR</td>
<td>7/1/2006</td>
<td>8/1/2006</td>
<td>4.57w</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New Employee Orientation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Future Team Projects

- **Search committee Chair Training** – in conjunction with Human Resources, this team should focus on the content and process design of the training program for Search committee Chairs.

- **Search committee Training** – in conjunction with Human Resources, this team should focus on the content and process design of the training program for Search committee Members.

- **Implementation of Search Committee Training into New Employee Orientation** – collaborative work with the new employee orientation team to implement search committee training into the orientation process.
Survey re Hiring Practices as related to the Selection Committees

1 – Have you ever been on a committee? Yes No

2 – Did you have training? Yes No

3 – Was the training done as part of a selection/hiring/search committee? Yes No

4 – How would you rate the training you’ve had?
   4: Excellent 3: Good 2: Fair 1: Poor
   4 3 2 1

5 – Who provided the training? (use name if possible)

6 – How long was the training?
   > 4 hours 2-4 hours
   1-2 hours less than 1 hour

7 – What materials, if any were provided?
   none
   OCC policies
   information on legal issues (such as what not to ask)
   sample questions
   other ____________________________

8 – What kind/s of future training would be helpful to you?

Comments:
Attachment 2

Employment Guide

(Revised January 2002)